

Minutes for Lake Rotorua Catchment Stakeholder Advisory Group, 19 August 2014

Rotorua District Council – Council Chambers

1061 Haupapa Street, Rotorua, 9:00 am start

Chair: Tanira Kingi

Present:

- Collective Reps: Stuart Morrison, Christine Paterson, Giselle Schweizer, Tony Cairns
- Lakes Water Quality Society: Don Atkinson, Warren Webber
- RDC: Paul Skinner
- Te Arawa Lakes Trust: Roku Mihinui
- Māori Trustee: Katarina Porou
- Te Arawa land owner Reps: John Fenwick, Clinton Hemana
- Small Blocks: Karl Weaver
- BOPRC: Anna Grayling, Sarah Omundsen, Andy Bruere
- Others: Simon Park (StAG Secretariat); Gloria Zamora, Gwyn Morgan (Fed Farmers), Phill Thomass, (Rotorua Lakes Community Board), Ben O'Brien (Beef + Lamb NZ)

Action summary

1. Ollie Parsons: Circulate project brief for Catchment Economic Impacts Analysis to Sandra Barns, Ben O'Brien and Gwyn Morgan
 2. Perrin's NDA impacts report is <http://www.rotorualakes.co.nz/vdb/document/754>
 3. Simon Park: Add detainment bunds to list for 5 year science review
 4. Sarah Omundsen: Give a considered response FNP 5 year review and clarify FNP terminology.
 5. Don Atkinson: Send TDR critical issues document to Gloria to be distributed.
 6. John Fenwick, Clinton Hemana and Katerina Porou: work together on liaising with Deloitte, Glen Hawkins and Māori Trustee on draft rules engagement contacts.
 7. Simon Park: Prepare and circulate 2017 science review method.
 8. Sandra Barns: Ask Mark McIntosh and Lee Matheson on mixed livestock for catchment analysis.
 9. Anna Grayling: Ask if advice "request for tender" can be released early to identify any opportunities for synergy between industry and council initiatives.
 10. Anna Grayling: Circulate ToR for Funding Entity Board
-

Item 1: Welcome, Karakia and Apologies

Chairman Tanira Kingi welcomed StAG members and attendees to the meeting and opened with a karakia.

Apologies: Cr Neil Oppatt, Cr Arapeta Tahana, Paulina Wilhelm, Wendy Roe, Stephen Lamb

Motion: Apologies approved. Fenwick, Stuart, CARRIED

Item 2: Minutes of previous meeting (15 July 2014)

Motion: Approved 15 July 2014 Minutes. Morgan/Webber, CARRIED
--

Item 3: General business items to add

- a) Anna Grayling: update on funding entity
 - b) Sarah Omundsen: update on Section 32
 - c) Farmers: comment on Overseer reference in 15 July minutes
-

Item 4: Phosphorous mitigation work in the Lake Rotorua Catchment

- a) **Rotorua P-Project:** John Paterson presented on the Rotorua- P Project and its purpose to identify and implement practical, durable and cost effective solutions. The presentation can be found at http://www.rotorualakes.co.nz/StAG_2014. Key points:
 - i) This solution is not a silver bullet, just one tool.
 - ii) Difference between nutrient losses i.e. N via leaching Vs P via runoff
 - iii) P-runoff occurs during large storm events, especially ephemeral overland flows. A 2008 NIWA study showed annual storm P loss of 9.6 tonnes. Ephemeral catchments add 25%, so total could be 12 tonnes.
 - iv) Best to manage/intercept P-load in storm water at source rather than in the lake
 - v) P-focused detainment bunds differ from '70s soil conservation detainment dams.
 - Detainment bunds aim to control residence time of storm water
 - University of Waikato student assessing if there is any N benefits too
- b) **Discussion**
 - i) If Farmer has a detainment bund put on his farm, will credit be given?
 - Council will need to discuss
 - ii) Currently 16 detainment bunds which have captured 25 kgP/yr (<1% of 10 tonne catchment target) but no cost analysis yet; bund cost varies considerably.
 - iii) NZTA has contributed \$ as the bunds reduce flooding on Tauranga direct road

Action: Simon Park to put detainment bunds on list for 5 year science review.

Item 5: Farm Nutrient Plan and industry plans i.e. Sustainable Milk Plan; Land and Environment Plan

- a) **FNPs**
 - i) Working party has been formed to help develop the statutory minimum requirements
 - ii) BORPC policy staff working with compliance team, meeting in one week.
 - iii) Draft rules assume FNPs updated at 5 year intervals
 - iv) FNP actions need to meet NDA target, or show managed reduction towards NDA

- v) Farm data recorded to measure/support those targets and managed reduction

b) Discussion

- i) Farmer concern that the certainty provided by a 20 or 35 year consent could be undermined if FNP reviews are set at 5 year intervals.
- ii) Farmer concern FNP reviews may be a back door mechanism to get more reductions if 100 tN incentive fund doesn't meet its target or if agricultural moves at a slower pace.
- iii) Should 5 year FNP reviews be optional if farmer has a 20 year plan?
- iv) Need more clarification on catchment Vs individual progress – what happens if targets are not met?
- 5 year FNP review aims to give flexibility and plans that are achievable
 - Resource consent condition review clauses are normal e.g. quarries with 5 year intervals for management plan updates within 25 year consent term.
 - Noted we don't have 300 quarry consents that rely on each other; the farmers have a collective catchment target.
- v) Suggest that Council needs to provide certainty to enable investment to occur.
- vi) Suggest if FNP shows managed reduction, there is no need for a 5 year review.

Action: Sarah Omundsen: provide a considered response on FNP reviews, review intervals, linkage to targets and clarify terminology.

c) SMPs and LEPs

- i) Simon Park and John Paterson currently working to align SMP with possible FNP requirements, especially linkages to NDAs.
- ii) Ben O'Brien discussed how SMPs and LEPs were developed in parallel by industry as pre-compliance tools to turn farmers into better land resource managers with improved profit and smaller environmental footprints, noting:
- Nutrient plans are currently part of LEP level 1.
 - LEP level 2 divides a farm into land management units to best match stock type, stocking rate and management to land capability.
 - Now that Councils are seeking to ensure good practice, they need to be specific on plan requirements so LEPs can be modified accordingly
 - Beef + Lamb NZ now building a "compliance" version of LEP as a baseline.
 - Two LEP workshops will be held next month, covering a wide range of beef and sheep farms. Goal is to train - workshops are for 15 people.
 - Consider removing nutrient budgets from LEPs to avoid attaching too many rules to the FNPs.
 - 23 dairy farms scheduled by DairyNZ for SMPs over coming months
 - A common SMP-LEP "dashboard" has been drafted to link non-regulatory plans and FNPs with input from John Paterson – currently on hold.
-

Item 6: Transferable Developmental Rights consideration by RDC – Paul Skinner

- a) TDRs to encourage land-use change (and N reduction) with new TDR lots allowing higher lot development density than otherwise provided for in District Plan.
- b) RDC seeking StAG support for TDRs to be considered by the District Plan Hearings Committee in March/April 2015 to ensure alignment with new regional land use rules due to be proposed in March 2015.
- c) A TDR working group has been formed with intent to meet in late September comprised of Gwyn Morgan, Don Atkinson, Stuart Morrison, Te Taru White, Warren Webber and Sandra Barns. At this time there is no formal ToR.
 - i) Critical issues have been distributed to the group
 - ii) Will work additionally to align BOPRC with RDC.
- d) StAG would like an update on group's progress.
- e) Unclear if TDRs will be completed prior to the current subdivision proposals.
- f) Difference between TDRs and \$40m incentives: TDRs are an additional incentive

Action: Don Atkinson: to send TDR critical issues to Gloria to be distributed.

Motion: Support given for TDRs being considered by the District Plan Hearings Committee in March/April 2015 to ensure alignment with new regional land use rules due to be proposed in March 2015. **Atkinson/Morgan, CARRIED**

Item 7: Consultation on draft rules

- a) **Feedback thus far-** Sarah Omundsen
 - i) 4 additional public sessions planned for September to improve awareness of small block owners (around 1300). Current BOPRC databases are limited.
 - Suggest BOPRC talk to rural delivery contractors as they know everyone who has rural land.
 - ii) Concern that BOPRC Councillors did not attend any public consultations.
 - iii) Many small block owners giving feedback - shocked, angry at draft rules.
 - iv) BOPRC comms support limited at present.
 - v) A summary of submissions thus far will be presented publicly.

Action: Sarah Omundsen: to work with Collective to set up a meeting with Councillors

- b) **Te Arawa Land Owner Engagement** - Tanira Kingi
 - i) Progress has been slow.
 - ii) Resourcing is needed from BORPC for reach Māori Farmers.
 - iii) 3 database sets: Deloitte's, Glen Hawkins and Māori Trustee. Suggestion to combine all 3 to get the most comprehensive Māori Landowner list.
 - iv) Katerina Porou gave an update on Te Tumu Paeroa: Currently resetting after reorganisation. A GIS farm database system is currently being created and may be found at <http://www.tetumupaeroa.co.nz/mywhenua>

Action: John Fenwick, Clinton Hemana and Katerina Porou to work together on liaising with Deloittes, Glen Hawkins and Māori Trustee on draft rules engagement contacts.

- c) Other scheduled consultations
 - i) September 8 (drystock) and September 22 (dairy) consultations set up by the Farmers Collective to give more farmers a platform to air concerns.
 - ii) Beef + Lamb: LEP workshop meetings 23 September and 28 September

Item 8: 2017 Science review method wording

- a) Moved to Subcommittee meeting
- b) Currently there are no technical groups set to report to StAG.
- c) Parameters currently being looked at for the science review.

Action: Simon Park: to circulate science review method.

Item 9: Updates

- a) Catchment economic analysis - Sandra Barns
 - i) Analysis is currently on target
 - ii) Question: Are mixed livestock being accounted for as well?

Action: Sandra Barns: to ask Mark McIntosh and Lee Matheson on mixed livestock.

- b) Advice to landowners - Anna Grayling
 - i) Two "requests for tenders" (RFT) due to be sent out to nutrient advisors and business planners.
 - ii) Beef + Lamb offered to assist in process - is there an opportunity for synergy?

Action: Anna Grayling: to ask if advice service RFT can be released early to identify any opportunities for synergy between industry and council initiatives.

- c) Land TAG update - Andy Bruere
 - i) Selection process has been completed and the panel included Tanira Kingi, Ants Roberts, Andy Bruere, Leilani Ngawhika and Simon Stokes.
 - ii) Over 30 EOIs submitted and 8 scientists/experts have been selected
 - iii) Hoping for 1st meeting by end of September.
 - iv) Observers attendance at Land TAG meetings will be considered by Council.
 - v) Agenda for Land TAG will be set by Council but StAG may make suggestions.
 - vi) Minutes will be put out on website for public and other interested parties.
 - vii) Sector scientists were not asked to be on Land TAG but may be co-opted.

Item 9: General Business

- a) Funding Entity update: Anna Grayling
 - i) ToR for board completed and will be presented to BORPC at its next meeting.
 - ii) A panel has been chosen for the recruitment process
 - iii) Aim is for Board to be established by October, operational by January 2015
 - iv) Any independent person on selection panel?

(1) 3 partners are represented.

Action: Anna Grayling: to circulate ToR for Funding Entity Board

b) Section 32 update: Sarah Omundsen

i) Tender process completed

ii) Beca has been contracted and work will be completed by February 2015.

c) Overseer

i) Noted that the farmers Collective **do not** currently endorse Overseer and are not convinced that it is fit for purpose.

ii) Simon working with Warwick and Sarah on a national coordination project on Overseer, taking account of its limitations and how to use it appropriately in regards to policy, rules, compliance and advice. This covers both use "as is" and how it can be improved.

iii) Acknowledged that Overseer does not include all mitigations that may reduce N loss. It also assumes "best practice" which may not actually occur.

Meeting Concluded 12:40 pm